# **CMS**

## DEPARTMENT OF CENTRAL MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Janel L. Forde, Acting Director

February 6, 2020

Dear Member of the Illinois General Assembly:

I am proud to present the 2020 African-American Employment Plan. During fiscal year (FY) 2019, the representation of African-Americans in the State's workforce (21.5 percent) was larger than their representation in the available labor market (12.7 percent). The percentages of African-Americans who reported to an agency Director or Secretary during FY 2019 (16.7 percent) and who were in positions requiring Senate confirmation (12.9 percent) were higher than the percentage of African-Americans within the labor market. The representation of African-Americans on job interview panels also increased.

We are pleased by these improvements, and ready to shoulder challenges. Leveraging data analysis enabled by our new African-American Diversity Dashboard, CMS is advising agencies to review their professional development programs to ensure all eligible employees receive information, assistance, and encouragement regarding these benefits. There has been a considerable drop (from 26 to 18 percent) in African-American participation in career advancement opportunities such as tuition reimbursement since FY 2018.

Under the leadership of Governor JB Pritzker and Lieutenant Governor Juliana Stratton, CMS is heading an effort to modernize and optimize the State's hiring system. We are transforming a complex, paper-based and confusing process into a streamlined, paperless online system in which hiring is prompt, transparent and automated.

CMS is seizing this opportunity to interweave principles of equity and inclusion into the fabric of the State's new hiring process until they become standard operating procedure. In 2019, CMS launched a pilot program for agencies to post merit compensation positions through the new system. So far, the results seem promising for supporting and furthering the State's workforce diversity efforts.

Throughout this transition to a new employment selection process, CMS is offering agencies sample language, templates, and training on how to scrutinize their internal employment selection processes through a lens of diversity, equity, and inclusion to overcome various barriers to employment unrelated to job ability.

I look forward to working with all of you in our collaborative effort to improve State government's ability to fully reflect, represent and be responsive to all of Illinois' communities.

Sincerely,

Janel L. Forde Acting Director

## 2020 African-American Employment Plan

## **Table of Contents**

Executive Summary	3
Governing Authority	5
Data Sources and African-American Diversity Dashboard	6
State of Illinois Personnel Hiring Reform Provides Opportunity to Interweave Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Principles into Redesigned Procedures	8
Statistics: African-American Demographic Data from State Database	9
Statistics: African-American Demographic Data from Agency Survey Responses	14
Analysis	15
Best Practices	16
Recommendations	17
Goals for Enriching the Diversity of the State's Workforce	19
Conclusion	19
Contact	20

## I. Executive Summary

The Department of Central Management Services (CMS) is committed to establishing State government as the employer of choice in Illinois, delivering to our stakeholders reliably high-quality work, outstanding services, and data-driven expertise. Currently, CMS is leading the effort to comprehensively reform the State's employment application, selection and hiring procedures. The goal is to design an optimized, automated, and prompt approach that enables the State to hire the highest qualified candidates for each vacancy.

It is the infusion of principles of diversity, equity, and inclusion into the State's employment selection system which will best position the State to attract, select, and retain the most highly qualified job candidates. Accordingly, CMS is thoughtfully working to establish a selection system free from barriers to employment unrelated to job ability that adversely affect communities. Unnecessarily narrowing the applicant pool frustrates the purpose of reform by decreasing the odds of hiring the highest qualified job candidate. It also restricts equitable access to the State's workforce preventing State government from being truly representative, reflective, and responsive to the people it is there to serve.

CMS is educating agencies how to navigate the redesigned hiring system and presenting them with tools to facilitate the incorporation of diversity principles into the hiring process. This ensures communities across the State have equitable access to State employment.

The State is more likely to hire individuals from communities that have historically been underrepresented in the State's workforce when sensitivity to diversity is heightened among employees. This is critical in positions that serve as gateways to the State's workforce, such as job interviewers and Human Resources staff.

Diversity among job interviewers offers candidate review by a variety of perspectives and improves interview quality by eliminating cultural reservation, enabling greater appreciation of a candidates' talents. Diversity among Human Resources personnel invites perspectives regarding employment recruitment and selection from members of communities with which the State strives to connect.

Similarly, the chances of attracting individuals from previously under-tapped communities, such as African-American communities, increase when agencies dedicate staff as liaisons to build relationships and trust, expanding the depth of outreach and increasing the chances of attracting African-American job candidates. CMS is guiding agencies with questions to consider, templates, and training.

CMS has worked in collaboration with the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council to develop the metrics used herein to measure the strength of the State's workforce diversity programs as viewed in the aggregate. This 2020 African-American Employment Plan reviews and analyzes State demographic data for African-Americans during FY 2019, highlights diversity best practices and makes recommendations to agencies regarding how to implement hiring practices and procedures that are inclusive and equitable as the means to enriching the diversity of their workforce.

## Key findings include:

- The proportion of State employees who are African-American (21.5 percent) is larger than the proportion of African-Americans in Illinois labor market (12.7 percent), though it is worth noting that the former is an absolute number (one person, one category), and the second involves individuals selecting multiple categories.
- Of employees who reported to an agency Director or Secretary 17 percent were African-American and of employees in positions requiring Senate confirmation 13 percent were African-American.
- The proportion of African-Americans in the State's overall workforce among supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial personnel has grown from last year; however, the proportion of African-Americans in the pool of new hires decreased.
- The diversity of the State's Human Resources staff has decreased since last year yet diversity on job interview panels has increased. Twenty percent of the State's certified interviewers were African-American.
- There has been a considerable drop (31 percent) in African-American participation in career advancement opportunities such as tuition reimbursement programs. Agencies should review their career advancement programs to ensure all eligible employees receive information, assistance, and encouragement regarding these benefits.
- Agencies are designating liaisons to African-American communities and granting them authority over recruitment, hiring/promotion, interviews, and policy-making.
- Agencies are introducing and expanding diversity trainings for employees, specifically unconscious bias training for job interviewers.

## **Key Conclusions:**

- The above key points illustrate that African-Americans are well-represented within the State's workforce and in top leadership positions. Nevertheless, there are several indicators that this diversity may not be sustainable.
- Since FY 2018, the representation of African-Americans has shrunk among those entering the workforce, among Human Resources staff, and in career development and/or tuition reimbursement programs.

## **Key Goals:**

- CMS aims to turn the State of Illinois into Illinois' employer of choice as State government's most valuable recruitment asset utilizing strategic, modern and dynamic approaches facilitated through hiring reform.
- Through training, practical tools, and guidance, CMS hopes to render agency consideration of diversity, equity, and inclusion principles standard operating procedure in the State's employment application, selection, and hiring process.
- CMS will partner with the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council and its newly formed working groups to leverage the data in the African-American Diversity Dashboard to identify agencies' opportunities for progress and engage these agencies with customized, data-driven guidance.
- To address the decreased representation of African-Americans in the State's new hire pool since FY 2018, CMS will support the efforts of the African-American Council to coordinate multi-agency outreach events within African-American communities.

#### II. **Governing Authority**

#### A. Legal Obligations to Strengthen Diversity of State's Workforce

#### 1. **African-American Employment Plan Act**

Pursuant to the African-American Employment Plan Act, CMS must develop and implement plans, in consultation with the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council, to increase the number of African-American State employees generally and to increase the number of African-American State employees in supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions. The Act applies to positions covered by the Personnel Code. 2

The African-American Employment Plan Act also requires:

- tracking hiring practices and promotions of African-American State employees;
- increasing the number of African-Americans employed by the State; and
- increasing the number of African-Americans who are promoted.<sup>3</sup>

#### 2. **African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council**

The African-American Employment Plan Act established the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council and tasked its members – Governor-appointed subject matter experts – with examining:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> African-American Employment Plan Act, at §5. <sup>2</sup> Illinois Personnel Code, 20 ILCS 415/4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> African-American Employment Plan Act, at §5.

- the prevalence and impact of African-Americans employed by State government;
- the barriers faced by African-Americans who seek employment or promotional opportunities in State government; and
- possible incentives that could be offered to foster employing and promoting African-Americans in State government.<sup>4</sup>

During FY 2019, the following individuals were members of the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council:

Reverend Marrice Coverson, Chair William Burch Arlene Coleman Sharryon Dunbar Pastor Kevin Anthony Ford Harold Rice Dalitso Sulamoyo

There were four vacancies during FY 2019, which are in the process of being filled.

During meetings, Council members discussed with each other, with agency representatives and with members of the general public, various obstacles impeding African-Americans' entry into and/or promotion through the State's workforce. Many of these obstacles will be eliminated through personnel hiring reform. Others are related to lack of awareness regarding State employment opportunities within African-American communities.

The Council began planning large, multi-agency career expos to help spread information about State employment. Envisioned are centralized opportunities for the public to attend educational workshops on the State's employment selection process, hear from the leadership of various State agencies connecting the agency's mission with public service, describing lesser known jobs within the agency, and offering a glimpse into the agency's culture. CMS outreach staff would offer one-on-one mini counseling sessions and there would be seminars to boost resume writing skills and presentations on the State's interview process.

The Council hopes to extend co-sponsorship invitations to members of the Hispanic, Asian-American, and Native American Councils and secure geographic locations across the State. These career expos are expected to launch in calendar year 2020.

## III. Data Sources and African-American Diversity Dashboard

#### A. Data Sources

This 2020 African-American Employment Plan draws from (a) computer-generated employment data from the State's Personnel database, (b) the United States Census website, and (c) agency

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>Id</u>, at §25(c).

responses to the 2020 African-American Employment Plan Survey. Data is presented via the online African-American Diversity Dashboard.

## 1. Computer-Generated Data from State's Personnel Database

Demographic statistics regarding the employment lifecycle in this African-American Employment Plan derive from the State's Personnel database, including representation within the workforce, new hire pool, veteran hire pool, and supervisory positions.

## 2. United States Census Data

Data on the demographic breakdowns of the Illinois general population and the Illinois labor market were obtained from the <u>United States Census website</u> and the <u>Illinois Department of Employment Security</u>, Economic Information and Analysis Division, Workforce Availability Information, respectively.

## 3. African-American Employment Plan Survey

## a. Statutory Authority

CMS is statutorily designated to develop the African-American Employment Plan, monitor State agency compliance, and receive agencies' annual reports regarding their efforts to implement the Employment Plan. CMS sends State agencies an annual African-American Employment Plan Survey to gather the necessary data. CMS takes agency responses at face value.

Agency survey responses fuel the visualizations included in the African-American Diversity Dashboard and include such metrics as interview panel diversity, diversity of human resources staff, and career development participation rates.

CMS is in the process of expanding the metrics included in the African-American Diversity Dashboard. Going forward, CMS expects to further improve the survey to account for internal ambiguity in survey responses.

## b. Voluntary Participation

State agencies with employees exempted from the Personnel Code are encouraged to participate in the State's workforce diversity program by completing the annual African-American Employment Plan Survey. CMS commends OEIG's voluntary participation each year.

## 4. Data Presentation: African-American Diversity Dashboard

Last year, CMS transformed how it displays and analyzes the State's workforce diversity data. Instead of inserting two-dimensional charts into the annual African-American Employment Plan, CMS synthesized agencies' current and previous survey responses and built an informative, visual and interactive African-American Diversity Dashboard. This tool allows users to quickly

access State-wide and agency-level data, examine yearly trends, and isolate agencies for performance and progress review.

The African-American Diversity Dashboard increases the State's transparency, accountability, and motivation to rely on data to drive diversity strategies. The African-American Diversity Dashboard can be found at <a href="https://www2.illinois.gov/cms/personnel/DEP/Pages/AAEP.aspx">https://www2.illinois.gov/cms/personnel/DEP/Pages/AAEP.aspx</a> and should be considered part of and examined in connection with this 2020 African-American Employment Plan.

# IV. State of Illinois Personnel Hiring Reform Provides Opportunity to Interweave Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Principles into Redesigned Procedures

The State of Illinois is undergoing a restructuring of its employment application and hiring procedures with the goal of converting the current complex, multi-agency hiring process into a simplified, paperless online system in which logarithms replace human subjectivity. In 2019, the State's efforts were honored with a national award for Innovation in State Government.

One of the primary upgrades is the transition from a paper-driven process to an automated process. The former system of hiring was confusing and did not utilize modern technologies, or industry standards. Such barriers to employment hamper the State's efforts to attract job candidates from communities under-represented in the workforce and they increase distrust between the State and communities least familiar with the State's employment selection system. These obstacles also narrow the State's chances of finding the ideal job candidate. To best serve the people of Illinois, diversity must be actively pursued and there can be no barriers to employment during the selection process that risk losing the ideal job candidate for reasons unrelated to job ability.

Under the Pritzker administration, the State is seizing the opportunity presented by the personnel hiring reform to interweave principles of diversity, equity, and inclusion into the fabric of the State's new hiring process. Inviting everyone to participate on equal footing in the selection process to be a State employee will be how the State becomes an employer of choice and best serves its constituents.

In 2019, the State rolled out a pilot program for the modernized and upgraded employment application and hiring system. The results to date are dramatically enhancing the applicant pool. The State's external reach improved significantly, with over 70 percent of the applicant pool originating from those seeking first-time State employment. Under the current system, less than one percent of candidates who are not current State employees are hired.

In addition, the new electronic process has reduced lead time for hiring from 330 days on average to 38 days or less and improved applicant satisfaction due to a revised and more effective online employment application. During 2020, the State intends to complete implementation of the reformed hiring process. In next year's African-American Employment Plan, CMS expects to include demographic data from the State's new hiring procedures.

## V. Statistics: African-American Demographic Data from State Database

Barometers for appraising the representation of African-Americans in the State's workforce are a) the representation of African-Americans in the general population and b) the representation of African-Americans in the relevant labor market.

The representation of African-Americans in the general population represents how well the workforce reflects the service population. The representation of African-Americans in the relevant labor market represents whether the State is underutilizing African-Americans in its workforce compared to the availability of African-Americans in the relevant labor market. The representation of African-Americans in both the general population and the labor market should be comparable to the representation of African-Americans in the State's workforce.<sup>5</sup>

The chart below contains Illinois State employee, general population, and available labor market data during FY 2019. As reflected, African-Americans represented 14.6 percent of the general population, 12.5 percent of the available labor market, and 21.5 percent of the State's workforce.

IL State Employees as of 6/30/2019					
Race/Ethnicity	Race/Ethnicity Count Percent				
Native American	196	0.4%			
Asian-American	1,273	2.8%			
African- American	9,693	21.5%			
Hispanic	2,940	6.5%			
White	31,052	68.8%			
Total	45,154	100.0%			

IL Population by Race/Ethnicity*		
Race/Ethnicity Percent		
Native American	0.7%	
Asian-American	5.9%	
African- American	14.6%	
Hispanic	17.4%	
White	76.9%	
White (Non- Hispanic)	61.0%	

IL Labor Population by Race/Ethnicity*			
Race/Ethnicity	Count	Percent	
Native American	15,205	0.2%	
Asian-American	366,224	5.5%	
African- American	848,754	12.7%	
Hispanic	1,068,506	16.0%	
White	4,931,536	73.9%	
Total	6,672,963		

POPULATION TOTAL

12,671,822

<sup>\*</sup>Source: US Census Bureau, 2017 American Community Survey

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Illinois Department of Human Rights monitors agencies' progress in meeting their affirmative action goals by measuring their success at reducing the gap between the representation of an affirmative action group in the agency's workforce compared to the availability of that affirmative action group in the labor force, called "underutilization." See, 56 Ill. Admin. Code §§2520.700-797 and the definition of "underutilization" in the Illinois Department of Human Rights, "Technical Assistance Guide for the Development of Affirmative Action Plans and Quarterly Reports for Illinois State Executive Agencies."

The chart below breaks down by agency the representation of the State's 9,693 African-American employees by agency. Readers are invited to review the <u>African-American Diversity Dashboard</u> for agency trends.

African-American Representation by Agency as of 6/30/2019			
Agency	African-American	Percent	<b>Employee Count</b>
Il Torture Inquiry Relief Commission	2	66.7%	3
Racing Board	2	66.7%	3
Investment Board	2	66.7%	3
Human Rights Commission	8	47.1%	17
Juvenile Justice	375	40.7%	921
Children & Family Services	1,044	39.8%	2,625
Human Rights Department	46	38.0%	121
Human Services	4,598	36.7%	12,524
Guardianship & Advocacy	34	34.7%	98
Employment Security	327	30.3%	1,079
Criminal Justice Authority	15	28.8%	52
Workers Compensation Commission	26	24.8%	105
Developmental Disabilities Council	1	20.0%	5
Financial & Professional Regulation	74	19.1%	387
Labor	14	18.7%	75
Labor Relations Board Educational	2	18.2%	11
Prisoner Review Board	4	18.2%	22
Lottery	25	17.6%	142
Healthcare & Family Services	265	17.4%	1,523
State Police Merit Board	1	16.7%	6
Commerce & Economic Opportunity	34	16.3%	208
Public Health	169	15.2%	1,111
Revenue	213	14.6%	1455
Arts Council	2	14.3%	14
Veterans Affairs	168	14.0%	1,201
Gaming Board	20	13.5%	148
Pollution Control Board	2	13.3%	15
Military Affairs	17	12.4%	137
Insurance	25	12.3%	203
Corrections	1,550	12.1%	12,838
Aging	16	11.9%	135
Capital Development Board	4	11.8%	34
State Police	110	11.6%	947
Central Management Services	84	10.1%	833
Commerce Commission	5	9.6%	52
Innovation & Technology	108	9.2%	1,178
Transportation	193	8.1%	2,387
Emergency Management Agency	5	7.2%	69
Labor Relations Board	1	7.1%	14
Agriculture	23	6.8%	340
Environmental Protection	38	6.4%	591
Property Tax Appeal Board	2	5.6%	36
State Fire Marshal	7	5.5%	128
Law Enforcement Training & Standards Board	1	5.0%	20

African-American Representation by Agency as of 6/30/2019			
Agency	African-American	Percent	Employee Count
State Retirement Systems	4	4.2%	96
Natural Resources	26	2.2%	1,157
Abraham Lincoln Presidential Library & Museum	1	1.3%	76
Independent Tax Tribunal	0	0.0%	1
Civil Service Commission	0	0.0%	4
Deaf & Hard Of Hearing Commission	0	0.0%	4
Statewide	9,693	21.5%	45,154

# A. Representation of African-Americans in Supervisory, Technical, Professional, and Managerial Positions

The African-American Employment Plan Act mandates improved representation of African-Americans in supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions. However, the Act does not define supervisory, technical, professional, or managerial. Nor does the State code positions as those categories.

For comparable information, this Employment Plan examines supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions through the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) Job Categories. State jobs are classified into one of eight EEOC Job Categories based on the content and responsibility of the job: Officials and Managers (e.g., department heads), Professionals (e.g., managers), Technicians (e.g., computer programmers, inspectors), Protective Service Workers (e.g., police/correctional officers, fire-fighters), Paraprofessionals (e.g., research assistants, medical aids), Office Clerical (e.g., administrative assistants), Skilled Craft Workers (e.g., mechanics, electricians), and Service Maintenance (e.g., custodial workers).

The EEOC Job Categories labeled Officials/Managers, Professionals, and Technicians include positions most consistent with supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions.

The chart below reflects that 27.1 percent of employees in supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions during FY 2019 were African-American.

Employees in Supervisory, Technical, Professional, and Managerial Roles by Race/Ethnicity as of 6/30/2019						
Position	Native American	Asian-American	African-American	Hispanic	White	Total
Supervisory	120	1,101	7,083	1,966	15,824	26,094
% Of Supervisory Total	0.5%	4.2%	27.1%	7.5%	60.6%	100.0%
Non-Supervisory	76	172	2,610	974	15,228	19,060
% Of Non-Supervisory Total	0.4%	0.9%	13.7%	5.1%	79.9%	100.0%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Sometimes referred to as Officials and Administrators. *See*, <u>Illinois Department of Human Rights</u>, "Technical Assistance Guide for the Development of Affirmative Action Plans and Quarterly Reports for Illinois State Executive Agencies."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Sometimes referred to as Administrative Support (Including Clerical and Sales). See, id.

## **B.** Representation of African-Americans among New Hires

As reflected below, African-Americans represented 21.8 percent of employees hired during FY 2019.

State Employees Hired in FY 2019			
Agency	# African- American	% African-American	Total
Juvenile Justice	55	52.9%	104
Human Rights Commission	1	50.0%	2
Human Services	331	38.0%	871
Children & Family Services	54	36.2%	149
Labor	2	33.3%	6
Employment Security	13	32.5%	40
Lottery	3	30.0%	10
Military Affairs	2	25.0%	8
Financial and Professional Regulations	8	25.0%	32
Human Rights Department	1	20.0%	5
Public Health	11	19.6%	56
Central Management Services	8	18.6%	43
Revenue	20	16.7%	120
Healthcare & Family Services	16	15.5%	103
Corrections	140	13.3%	1,050
Aging	1	12.5%	8
Emergency Management Agency	1	11.1%	9
Veterans Affairs	8	10.8%	74
Insurance	2	10.0%	20
Innovation & Technology	4	8.7%	46
Agriculture G,	2	6.7%	30
Transportation	12	6.3%	191
Commerce & Economic Opportunity	1	6.3%	16
State Police	3	5.6%	54
Environmental Protection	1	4.0%	25
Natural Resources	1	0.9%	114
Racing Board	0	0.0%	1
Criminal Justice Authority	0	0.0%	1
Labor Relations Board	0	0.0%	1
Workers Compensation Commission	0	0.0%	1
Gaming Board	0	0.0%	1
State Retirement Systems	0	0.0%	1
Commerce Commission	0	0.0%	2
Guardianship & Advocacy	0	0.0%	2
Property Tax Appeal Board	0	0.0%	5
Abraham Lincoln Presidential Library & Museum	0	0.0%	8
State Fire Marshal	0	0.0%	8
Statewide	701	21.8%	3,217

## C. Representation of African-Americans among Veteran New Hires

Under State law, qualified veterans are entitled to bonus points and appointment preferences during the employment selection process.<sup>8</sup> During FY 2019, of the new hires who were veterans, 15.4 percent were African-American.

African- American Veteran New Hires in FY 2019			
Agency	# African-American	% African-American	Total
Labor	1	100.0%	1
Lottery	3	75.0%	4
Juvenile Justice	2	50.0%	4
Aging	1	50.0%	2
Human Services	30	42.9%	70
Revenue	1	33.3%	3
Veterans Affairs	3	27.3%	11
Public Health	1	25.0%	4
Central Management Services	2	25.0%	8
Healthcare & Family Services	4	21.1%	19
Agriculture	1	20.0%	5
Children & Family Services	2	20.0%	10
Military Affairs	1	20.0%	5
Employment Security	1	16.7%	6
Transportation	8	7.4%	108
Corrections	10	6.7%	150
Commerce & Economic Opportunity	0	0.0%	1
Insurance	0	0.0%	1
Human Rights Department	0	0.0%	1
Labor Relations Board	0	0.0%	1
State Retirement Systems	0	0.0%	1
Financial & Professional Regulations	0	0.0%	2
Environmental Protection	0	0.0%	2
Emergency Management Agency	0	0.0%	3
State Fire Marshal	0	0.0%	3
State Police	0	0.0%	8
Innovation & Technology	0	0.0%	8
Natural Resources	0	0.0%	21
Statewide	71	15.4%	462

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See, CMS' Personnel website.

## VI. Statistics: African-American Demographic Data from Agency Survey Responses

As reflected in the chart below, of State-wide Human Resources staff, 20 percent were people of color and 13 percent were African-American. Across the State, 13,642 interviews were conducted. People of color served as interviewers 44 percent of the time and African-Americans, specifically, 33 percent of the time. Approximately half (49.8 percent) of the State's interview panels were entirely White.

Twenty percent of the State's interviewers were African-American in FY 2019. Two hundred twenty-eight African-Americans participated on an interview panel.

Diversity / Diversity	Diversity / Diversity Expertise Among Gatekeepers to State Employment in FY 2019			
	# HR Staff	Count 419	Percent	
Human Resources	# and % HR Staff who were minorities # and % HR Staff who were African-Americans	84 56	20.0% 13.4%	
Interview Panels	# Rutan Panels # and % Panels with at least one person of color	13,642 5,848	43.8%	
	# and % Panels with at least one African-American # and % Panels Entirely White	4,384 6,502	32.9% 48.7%	
Interviewers	# Certified Interviewers # and % African-American Interviewers	3,499 690	19.7%	
	# and % African-American Interviewers on a Panel in FY19	228	6.5%	
Customized Unconscious Bias Training	# Agencies with Unconscious Bias Training for Interviewers	6		
	# Agencies with Unconscious Bias Training for HR Staff	5		

The most senior positions in agencies behind the agency Director or Secretary are those that either report to the Director or Secretary or require Senate confirmation. The chart below reflects that 16.7 percent of employees reporting to the agency Director or Secretary were African-American as were 12.9 percent of employees in positions requiring Senate confirmation.

African-Americans in Leadership Positions in FY 2019			
	Count	Percent	
# and % African-Americans Reporting to Agency Director/Secretary	113	16.7%	
# and % of African-Americans in Positions Requiring Senate Confirmation	9	12.9%	

As reflected in the chart below, in many agencies that have dedicated staff to serve as liaisons to African-American communities such employees had authority over recruitment, hiring/promotion, interviews, and policy-making.

Liaisons to African-American Communities in FY 2019		
# Agencies with Liaison to African-American Communities		
	# Agencies with Decision-Making Authority	
Recruitment	10	
Hiring/promotion	7	
Interviews	6	
Creating policies	4	

As reflected below, 15 agencies conducted diversity training in FY 2019 and six specifically conducted unconscious bias training.

Agency Diversity Trainings in FY 2019	
# Agencies with Unconscious Bias Training	6
# Agencies with Diversity Training	15

## VII. Analysis

At the end of FY 2019, the proportion of State employees who were African-American had risen from 21.4 percent at the end of FY 2018 to 21.5 percent. At the same time, representation of African-Americans in the State's labor market dropped from 12.7 percent at the end of FY 2018 to 12.3 percent at the end of FY 2019.

In FY 2018, 23.4 percent of supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial positions were filled by African-Americans. That figure increased in FY 2019 to 27.1 percent.

Of employees hired during FY 2019, 21.8 were African-American, which is a decrease from the 25.1 percent hired during FY 2018. The proportion of veterans hired that were African-Americans increased between FY 2018 and 2019, from 14.4 percent to 15.4 percent.

African-American representation in leadership positions is reflected through the fact that 17 percent of employees reporting to the agency Director or Secretary were African-American as were 13 percent of employees in positions requiring Senate confirmation.

Of State-wide Human Resources staff, 20 percent were people of color and 13 percent are African-American. In FY 2019, 13,642 interviews were conducted across the State. People of color served as interviewers in 44 percent of the panels. Two hundred twenty-eight African-Americans participated on interview panels. Approximately half (49.8 percent) of the State's interview panels were entirely White. 19.7 percent of the State's interviewers were African-American.

Thirty-four agencies reported offering career development opportunities. Of the employees who received tuition reimbursement for educational advancement during FY 2019, 18 percent were African-American, down from 26 percent during FY 2018.

For agencies that dedicated staff to serve as liaisons to African-American communities, those liaisons generally had authority over recruitment, hiring/promotion, interviews, and policy-making. And more agencies are putting their interviewers and Human Resources staff through unconscious bias training, as well as offering all employees some form of diversity training.

#### **VIII. Best Practices**

## A. Commitment of Senior Leadership

The single most effective technique for successful execution of diversity and inclusion initiatives is when they are visibly prioritized by the organization's leadership. In fact, without leadership's active support and engagement, diversity initiatives fail.

## B. Broad Employment Outreach

Employment outreach is crucial. It shapes the applicant pool and improves diversity. Broad, strategic outreach increases access to State employment and thereby effectuates the State's goals of attracting a diverse, highly-qualified group of job candidates.

## C. Intentionality

Diversity efforts must be intentional and deliberate; diversity and inclusion do not occur by happenstance. Dedicating resources to diversity and inclusion efforts reflects priority and enables success. Dedicated resources often take the form of a budget allocation, and the African-American Employment Plan Act requires each agency to report their African-American employment budget allocations as part of their annual reports on their African-American workforce diversity strategies.

## **D.** Diversity training

Diversity trainings normalize diversity, familiarize employees with its strengths and advantages, offer strategies for handling unconscious bias, and demonstrate organizational commitment. Diversity training can elevate awareness of the unconscious biases that exist within every person and subtly guide our decisions. <sup>10</sup>

<sup>9</sup> Some State-sponsored programs were not funded in recent years when Illinois did not have a budget and have not yet returned to their prior performance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Unconscious bias is hard-wired into the human brain and cemented by years of exposure to subtle societal influences (e.g., media, social and professional environments, lack of familiarity with different cultures). Multiple unconscious biases subtly guide our behavior, despite best intentions, and counteract diversity efforts, shape company culture, and bear a cost for businesses. <u>Harvard Business Review</u>, "How Diversity Can Drive Innovation," (December 2013); University of North Carolina Kenan-Flagler Business School, "The Real Effects of Unconscious Bias in the Workplace," Horace McCormick, Program Director, UNC Executive Development (2015).

### IX. Recommendations

CMS offers the following examples of how State agencies can begin or continue to incorporate principles of diversity, equity, and inclusion into their workforces and hiring policies both now and after the transition to the upgraded employment selection system.

As a general best practice, agencies should investigate their internal hiring procedures and practices through a lens of diversity, equity, and inclusion. They should examine areas in which highly qualified candidates could be inadvertently omitted or eliminated from consideration for employment.

## A. Incorporate Diversity Principles into Agency's Hiring Teams

Sensitivity to the State's goal of a diverse and inclusive workforce is crucial among those who serve as gateways to State employment; i.e., staff involved in various aspects of the decision-making process. Agencies should ensure all teams involved in employment-related decisions are diverse and inclusive.

Sensitivity to diversity can come from a team comprised of individuals with differing perspectives and also through training. The consequences of the decisions reached by the State's employment gatekeepers will have a powerful impact on the demographic makeup of the State's new hire pool and workforce. Equity and operational excellence demand that hiring decisions be as free as possible from bias.

## B. Maximize Value of Employment Outreach

## 1. CMS Developing New Model for Employment Outreach and Recruitment for State of Illinois

Personnel hiring reform creates exponential opportunities to maximize the value and return on investment in the State's recruitment efforts. The transition from hiring off of an eligibility list to position-specific hiring will increase the effectiveness and value of recruiting for that position.

CMS is preparing the State to become proactive rather than reactive. As new, more diverse generations enter the workforce, the State must be poised to attract them away from other opportunities. Social media, mobile applications and virtual tours are some of the modernized methods for the State to appeal to today's technologically savvy job candidates, including millennials and post-millennials.

## 2. Take Advantage of Underutilization Data to Drive Outreach

On a quarterly basis, agencies submit to the Department of Human Rights their underutilization data; e.g., data reflecting whether and in what quantities the representation of African-Americans in the State's workforce is lower than the representation of African-Americans in the relevant labor market <sup>11</sup>

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See, footnote 7 for more information on underutilization.

When agencies are crafting outreach plans before posting employment opportunities, they should consult the underutilization data from the previous quarter and take steps to dispatch outreach resources to the African-American community in the surrounding area.

CMS created a template for agencies to use that guides them through the process of leveraging underutilization information for targeted recruitment.

## 3. Dedicate Liaisons with Authority to African-American Communities

Designating liaisons who can build relationships and trust in African-American communities expands the depth of outreach, increasing the chances of attracting qualified candidates with diverse backgrounds. To be effective, liaisons must operate with the credibility of decision-authority over the employment selection process, including recruitment, hiring, promotion, interviews, and policy-creation.

## C. Continuously Consult Data for Informed Decisions

Agencies should familiarize themselves with the African-American Diversity Dashboard and learn to compare their diversity metrics against those of other agencies, the State as a whole, and their own prior performance. These metrics offer agencies a high-level perspective on the ways in which various business decisions can impact their diversity efforts. Agencies can conduct self-evaluations and adjust their approaches accordingly.

Agencies should also run regular statistical analyses of screening mechanisms throughout the employment selection process (e.g., interview selection, interview scores, hire) to identify any potential adverse impact on African-Americans, promptly take steps to investigate and then resolve the concern before the final hiring decision.

## **D.** Be Innovative

Agencies are experts on their internal procedures and practices. Diversity initiatives are creative and those most effective are customized to the specific work environment. Agencies, therefore, are in opportune positions to explore ideas based on their unique operating procedures and cultures.

Many agencies are beginning, and others are encouraged, to actively develop additional methods of measuring, evaluating, and advancing their diversity and inclusion goals. Success stories are welcome.

## E. Attend African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council Meetings

Agencies are invited to benefit from the collective knowledge and experience of the Governor-appointed subject matter experts selected to serve as members of the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council.

The African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council meets quarterly in Chicago, Springfield and via WebEx to discuss agencies' progress and challenges in implementing the African-American Employment Plan. Agencies will have the chance to share best practices and lessons learned, advance diversity initiatives through working groups, and provide input into the following year's African-American Employment Plan.

## X. Goals for Enriching the Diversity of the State's Workforce

- A. CMS strives to make agency consideration of diversity, equity, and inclusion principles standard operating procedure in the State's employment application, selection, and hiring process. Agencies have been provided tangible tools in the form of sample language, templates, and training regarding how to overcome various barriers in their employment selection processes with inclusion in mind.
- **B.** Due to CMS' newly-formed Data Practice, diversity metrics can be publicly measured for progress and data collection and analysis will be sharpened. The African-American Diversity Dashboard is expected to serve as the data engine fueling agency-level and State-wide employment decisions.
- C. CMS is poised to become the State's most valuable recruitment asset with the goal of turning the State of Illinois into Illinois' employer of choice. Utilizing strategic, modern and dynamic approaches facilitated through hiring reform, CMS will endeavor to capitalize on previously untapped resources to propel the State forward to attract the brightest and best qualified candidates to the workforce through a transparent and effective selection system that offers all communities equitable opportunities to compete.
- **D.** By law, CMS supports the African-American, Hispanic, Asian-American, and Native American Employment Plan Advisory Councils. In FY 2020, CMS plans to revitalize the Council experience. Collaborating with the Chairs of each Council, CMS will forge innovative ideas for the Councils to partner over with employment outreach and deeper community engagement.

## XI. Conclusion

During FY 2019, African-Americans had an increased presence in the State's workforce and also among supervisory, technical, professional, and managerial personnel compared to FY 2018. New this year, are data reflecting that 16.7 percent of employees who reported to the agency Director or Secretary in FY 2018 were African-American as were 12.9 percent of employees in positions requiring Senate confirmation. Yet, the proportion of African-Americans among new hires decreased.

The diversity of the State's Human Resources staff has decreased for African-Americans since the previous fiscal year from 24 percent to 13 percent, yet the diversity of interview panels has increased from 34 percent to 44 percent.

African-American participation in career development opportunities decreased from 26 percent in FY 2018 to 18 percent in FY 2019, suggesting agencies should review their career advancement programs to ensure all employees receive information, assistance, and encouragement regarding these benefits.

Survey data also reflect that agencies are granting authority over recruitment, hiring/promotion, interviews, and policy-making to their liaisons to African-American communities rather than using staff with no influence. And agencies are introducing and expanding diversity trainings, specifically unconscious bias training for interviewers and Human Resources staff; gateways to the State's workforce.

As the State begins a new chapter through personnel hiring reform, opportunities for revamped or new diversity initiatives and metrics will present themselves. We look forward to working with the African-American Employment Plan Advisory Council, agency staff, elected officials, the public, and all other stakeholders to create customized, data-driven, and creative strategies to continue enriching the diversity of the State's workforce to the benefit of all the people of Illinois.

#### XII. Contact

Feedback, questions, and suggestions are invited and should be directed to:

Lisa G. Williams
Deputy Director of Diversity and Inclusion
Lisa.g.williams@illinois.gov
(312) 814-8213